

Translation Strategies in Indonesian Subtitle and Dubbing of *The Greatest Showman*

Yovita Jane¹, Julia Eka Rini²

English Department, Faculty of Humanities and Creative Industries, Petra Christian University,
Siwalankerto 121-131, Surabaya 60236, INDONESIA
e-mail: a11180067@petra.ac.id¹, jerini@petra.ac.id²

ABSTRACT

Several studies have compared translation strategies to analyze subtitles and dubbing in movies, but few have compared the differences between the two mediums. This study compared the translation strategies used in movie subtitles and dubbing. Baker's (2018) translation strategies are used to analyze the Disney+ subtitle and dubbing of *The Greatest Showman*. Baker (2018) identifies 12 translation strategies used in the subtitle and dubbing: general word, more neutral/less expressive word, cultural substitution, loan word and explanation, paraphrase using related words, paraphrase using unrelated words, omission, idiom of similar meaning and form, idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form, paraphrase, omission of a play on idiom, omission of entire idiom. One strategy, borrowing the source language idiom, employed by the dubbing is not found in the subtitle and one strategy, illustration, is not used in both. The fact that using the same strategy does not produce the same translation result shows that there are infinite interpretations.

Keywords: translation strategies, subtitle, dubbing

INTRODUCTION

Movies are one of the most popular forms of entertainment today. To follow the context and storyline in a movie, one must be able to understand the language. Hence, language barriers may be a hindrance as movies come in many languages. Thus, to enjoy movies, subtitling and dubbing are needed. For this research, the writer chose *The Greatest Showman*, a movie directed by Michael Gracey. This movie has won several awards, including Best Action or Adventure Film from Saturn Awards, Top Box Office Films from ASCAP, and others (IMDb, n.d.). The movie grossed \$ 435 million worldwide against an \$84 million production budget. To the writer's knowledge, many studies about translation strategies in movies have been done, but few compare subtitles and dubbing. Analyzing the difference between these two mediums is intriguing as each medium faces its own challenges. This study aimed to find out the translation strategies used in the Indonesian subtitles and dubbing of the movie *The Greatest Showman*.

Subtitles are captions that appear at the bottom of a movie or TV screen that translate or transcribe the dialogue or story (Oxford University Press, n.d.). Translating for subtitles is not an easy task as it faces many challenges: limited time, restricted space, limited characters, proper grammar, syntax, annotation, and many others (Bogdan & Biklen, 2007). Chaume (2012, as stated in Baños & Díaz-Cintas, 2017, p.314) defines dubbing as a process which "consists of replacing the original track of a film's (or any audiovisual text) source language dialogues with another track on which translated dialogues have been recorded in the target language." Like subtitling, dubbing also has its own challenges such as time, the number of syllables, synchronization, and how sentences are divided (Elnamoury, 2014).

The theory used as a theoretical framework in this study is Baker's (2018) translation strategies. These strategies are: translation by a more general word, less expressive word, cultural substitution, loan word and loan word plus explanation, paraphrase using related words, paraphrase using unrelated words, omission, illustration, idiom of similar meaning and form,

idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form, borrowing the source language idiom, paraphrase, omission of a play on idiom, omission of entire idiom.

METHODS

For this study, the writer used a qualitative approach. The data were taken from the movie *The Greatest Showman* streamed via Disney+. The English transcript and subtitle were downloaded online. Then, the writer duplicates the subtitle, listens to the dubbing and makes changes following the dubbed audio dialogue. The writer highlights the differences available between the subtitle and dubbing utterances. After highlighting differences, the data is transferred into a table. The final step the writer did was analyzing the data based on the translation strategies provided by Baker (2018).

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this section, the writer discusses her findings. This section is divided into two parts: (1) translation strategies used in the Indonesian subtitle of the movie *The Greatest Showman* and (2) translation strategies used in the Indonesian dubbing of the movie *The Greatest Showman*.

The Translation Strategies Used in the Indonesian Subtitle of the Movie *The Greatest Showman*

The translation strategies used in the Indonesian subtitle are: general word, less expressive word, cultural substitution, loan word and explanation, paraphrase using related words, paraphrase using unrelated words, omission, idiom of similar meaning and form, idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form, paraphrase, omission of a play on idiom, omission of entire idiom.

General word is one of the most common methods used in translation. Below is an example:

Data 1.69	
Utterance	: The goat prices go up, so the pork bellies go down.
Indonesian Subtitle	: Harga kambing naik, jadi harga babi turun.
Back-translation	: The goat price goes up, so the price of pork goes down.

The utterance of data 1.69 is considered a general word as the translator translates ‘pork bellies’ to ‘pork’ only. ‘Pork’ is pig’s meat in general. On the other hand, ‘Pork belly’ is a specific part of the pig’s belly used for meat.

Another strategy is translation by a **less expressive word**. Here is an example:

Data 1.89	
Utterance	: They’re all the rage in Europe.
Indonesian Subtitle	: Semua ini populer di Eropa.
Back-translation	: They’re all popular in Europe.

The utterance of Data 1.89 reflects the use of more neutral/ less expressive words. In the English language, the word ‘rage’ could mean several things. The definition of rage could both mean an intense feeling or widespread temporary enthusiasm. In this context, the meaning that the SL portrays is temporary enthusiasm. However, when translated literally, the word ‘the rage’ means ‘kemarahan’ in Indonesian, another word for ‘anger.’ It does not fit the context of the dialogue. Hence, a more neutral word, ‘popular,’ is used.

The third strategy used is translation by **cultural substitution**. Here is an example:

Data 1.38	
Utterance	: Oh, God!

Indonesian Subtitle : **Astaga!**
 Back-translation : **Gosh!**

The utterance of data 1.38 shows an example of using cultural substitution by translating the expression ‘Oh, God’ to ‘Gosh,’ rather than translating it literally to ‘Oh, Tuhan.’ This translation is considered cultural substitution as different cultures have different ways of expressing shock using words.

The fourth strategy frequently used to translate culturally specific terms is translation by **loan words**. Below is an example:

Data 225
 Utterance : Youngest prima ballerina in the history of the **City Ballet**.
 Indonesian Subtitle : Penari balet mahir termuda dalam sejarah **City Ballet**.
 Back-translation : Youngest skilled ballerina in the history of **City Ballet**.

The utterance of Data 225 is an example of the use of loan words in translation. The translator uses the original SL word for the translation, which is ‘City Ballet.’ A reason for this loan word translation is because City Ballet is the name of an Academy and a patent name is not translated.

The fifth translation strategy is to **paraphrase using related words**. An example is given below:

Data 1.4
 Utterance : **We’re gonna** miss the train.
 Indonesian Subtitle : **Nanti kita** ketinggalan kereta.
 Back-translation : **Later we** miss the train.

The utterance available in data 1.4 is an example of paraphrasing using unrelated words. The translator translates ‘We’re gonna...’ to ‘Later we...’. The word ‘nanti’ is a time signal which means ‘later.’ Here, the verb ‘going to’ is changed to the time signal ‘later’ to show what will happen if an action is not done.

The sixth translation strategy explained by Baker (2018) is translation by **paraphrase using unrelated words**. Here is an example:

Data 1.87
 Utterance : A place to be **transported**.
 Indonesian Subtitle : Tempat untuk **bersenang-senang**.
 Back-translation : A place to be **happy**.

The utterance of data 1.87 showcases the use of translation by paraphrase using unrelated words by translating the word ‘transported’ to ‘happy.’ The word transport could mean two things: to take (people or goods) from one place to another or overwhelm someone with strong emotions, usually joy. In this context, the SL means the first definition of transport. However, the translator chooses to use an unrelated word to translate transported as the word ‘transported’ used in this context, has no equivalent meaning.

The seventh translation strategy is translation by **omission**. Below is an example:

Data 1.1
 Utterance : I understand, yes. Thank you so much, Mr. Jeffries.
Thank you.
 Indonesian Subtitle : Aku mengerti, ya. Terima kasih, Tn. Jeffries.
 Back-translation : I understand, yes. Thank you, Mr. Jeffries.

The utterance of data 1.1 is an example of translation by omission. The translator decides to omit 'thank you.' The translator does the omission as omitting repetitions is not vital enough in the development of the text. Moreover, it does not harm the meaning conveyed.

One of the strategies used to translate words above level is **idiom of similar meaning and form**. Here is an example:

Data 262

Utterance : **Let's just say** that I find it much more comfortable admiring your show from afar.

Indonesian Subtitle : **Anggaplah** aku lebih nyaman mengagumi acaramu dari jauh.

Back-translation : **Let's say** I'm more comfortable admiring your show from afar.

The utterance of Data 262 is an example of using idiom of similar meaning and form. The translator translates the phrase 'Let's just say' to 'anggaplah,' which is an equivalent of 'Let's say' in bahasa Indonesia.

Another strategy that is used to translate words above word levels is **idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form**. Below is an example:

Data 1.37

Utterance : Oh, **you're in for it!**

Indonesian Subtitle : **Awas kau!**

Back-translation : **You better watch out!**

The utterance present in data 1.37 is an example of an Idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form by translating 'you're in for it' to 'you better watch out' as there is no equivalence for the phrase 'you're in for it' in Bahasa Indonesia. This non-equivalence is that the phrase 'in for it' is a fixed expression in English that means certain to be punished. Hence, in this case, the closest meaning to that idiom is another similar yet common fixed expression: 'You better watch out!'

Another strategy used to translate words above word levels is **paraphrase**. An example is given below:

Data 1.2

Utterance : You'll have the money **by the end of the day**.

Indonesian Subtitle : Kau akan terima uangmu **malam ini**.

Back-translation : You'll receive the money **tonight**.

The utterance of data 1.2 displays the characteristic of translation of an idiom by paraphrase by translating 'by the end of the day' to 'tonight.' The meaning of the idiom 'by the end of the day' is before the day ends. In other words, it can be any time: afternoon, evening, night, as long as the clock has yet to strike midnight. On the other hand, the translator uses the word 'tonight' as translation which in fact does fit a part of the definition of 'by the end of the day.'

The tenth translation strategy present in the Indonesian subtitle is translation by **omission of a play on idiom**. This is an example:

Data 1.19

Utterance : Hey, you partners, look who **moseyed into the corral**.

Indonesian Subtitle : Anak-anak, lihat siapa yang **datang**.
 Back-translation : Kids, look who **came**.

The use of omission of a play on idiom is demonstrated in the utterance of data 1.19 by translating 'moseyed into the corral' to 'came.' 'Moseyed into the corral' is a classic word of old-time Western. It is an idiom that has the meaning of walking or moving in a leisurely manner. As there was no equivalent of this expression in the Indonesian language, the translator decided to omit the play of the idiom and translate it to 'came.'

The last strategy used in the Indonesian subtitle to translate above words level is **omission of entire idiom**. Here is an example:

Data 1.339
 Utterance : And at 20 percent **of the gate**, it'll be a queen's ransom for your efforts.
 Indonesian Subtitle : Dan dengan bagian 20 persen, kau akan terima banyak uang.
 Back-translation : And with a 20 percent share, you'll get a lot of money.

The utterance of data 1.339 displays an example of omission of an entire idiom. The translator did not translate the fixed expression 'of the gate', meaning immediately or from the start. In the context of the utterance, the use of 'of the gate' means that Lind will immediately receive 20 percent of her share right upfront. However, the translator decides to omit this translation.

The Translation Strategies Used in the Indonesian Dubbing of the Movie *The Greatest Showman*

The translation strategies used in the Indonesian subtitle are: general word, less expressive word, cultural substitution, loan word and explanation, paraphrase using related words, paraphrase using unrelated words, omission, idiom of similar meaning and form, idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form, borrowing the source language idiom, paraphrase, omission of a play on idiom, omission of entire idiom.

The first strategy used by Indonesian dubbing is translation by **general word**. Below is an example:

Data 1.31
 Utterance : **Gentlemen!** Can I have your attention?
 Indonesian Dubbing : **Semuanya!** Bisa minta perhatiannya?
 Back-translation : **Everyone!** Can I have your attention?

The utterance of data 1.31 demonstrates the use of general word in translation by translating 'Gentlemen' as 'Everyone.' The term 'gentlemen' refers to the male gender. It does not refer to the female gender. By contrast, the term 'Everyone' refers to both male and female gender.

The second strategy is translation by **less expressive word**. Here is an example:

Data 1.281
 Utterance : "The protests **cement** Mr. Barnum's reputation as a purveyor of the offensive and indecent."
 Indonesian Dubbing : "Para pemrotes **menyebut** reputasi Pak Barnum sebagai si pembuat malu dan tidak sopan."
 Back-translation : "Protesters **cite** Mr. Barnum's reputation as shameful and disrespectful."

The utterance of data 1.51 is one of numerous examples of translation by more neutral/less expressive words by translating the word ‘cement’ into ‘cite.’ The word cement in English has multiple meanings. When the word ‘cement’ is used as a verb, the meaning of cement could mean ‘to attach with cement’ or ‘to settle or establish firmly.’ In this case, the SL defines ‘cement’ as the second meaning explained above, ‘to settle.’ However, in the Indonesian Language, the word ‘cement’ as a verb could only mean one thing: ‘to attach with cement.’ Therefore, the translator decided to use a less expressive word to translate ‘cement’ to ‘cite.’

Another translation strategy applied in Indonesian dubbing is translation by **cultural substitution**. An example is given below:

Data 1.349	
Utterance	: Oh, God. I hope she can sing.
Indonesian Dubbing	: Astaga. Semoga dia bisa bernyanyi.
Back-translation	: Good grief. I hope she can sing.

The utterance in data 1.349 exemplifies the use of cultural substitution in translation by translating ‘Oh, God’ to ‘Good grief.’ The use of ‘Oh, God’ has several different expressions. It could be used to express disbelief, frustration, excitement, or anger. In this context, the use of ‘Oh, God’ is used to express disbelief. Using the word ‘Astaga’ is an excellent cultural substitution for expressing ‘Oh, God.’

The fourth strategy discussed is translation **using loan word or loan words plus explanation**. Below given an example:

Data 1.310	
Utterance	: Not to mention the French Opera
Indonesian Dubbing	: Belum lagi di French Opera.
Back-translation	: Not to mention at French Opera.

The utterance of data 1.310 portrays an example of the use of loan words in translation by translating ‘French Opera’ into ‘Opera Perancis.’ French Opera is one of Europe’s most important operatic traditions. The word ‘french opera’ is uncommon in Indonesian culture, and many Indonesians are unaware of it. Hence, the translator decides to keep the source language.

The fifth translation strategy is translation by **paraphrase using a related word**. Given below is an example:

Data 1.64	
Utterance	: I wish for ballet slippers.
Indonesian Dubbing	: Aku ingin sepasang sepatu balet.
Back-translation	: I wish for a pair of ballet slippers.

The utterance of data 1.64 showcases the use of translation by paraphrase using related words. The translator translates ‘I wish for ballet slippers’ to ‘I wish for a pair of ballet slippers.’ The translator added the phrase ‘a pair of’, which is the measure word for shoes.

The sixth translation strategy suggested by Baker (2018) is translation by **paraphrase using unrelated words**. This is an example:

Data 1.1	
Utterance	: I understand , yes. Thank you so much, Mr. Jeffries. Thank you.
Indonesian Dubbing	: Baiklah. Iya Terima kasih, Pak Jeffries. Terima kasih.
Back-translation	: Okay. Yes. Thank you, Mr. Jeffries. Thank you.

The utterance of data 1.1 is an example of translation by paraphrase using unrelated words by translating 'I understand' to 'okay.' These two words have different meanings, but both words can be used in similar situations. Both 'I understand' and 'okay' in this case shows affirmation. Hence, translating 'I understand' to 'okay' is appropriate.

The seventh translation strategy is translation by **omission**. The following is an example:

Data 1.92	
Utterance	: Come here. See?
Indonesian Dubbing	: -
Back-translation	: -

The utterance of data 1.92 is an example of translation by omission. The translator did not bother translating the SL and completely omitted the whole utterance. The omission was done as the utterance is not significant enough towards the context of the conversation.

Another strategy used to translate words above word levels is **idiom of similar meaning and dissimilar form**. Below is an example:

Data 387	
Utterance	: Well, Phineas I believe I told you that free champagne is a recipe for disaster .
Indonesian Dubbing	: Phineas, aku yakin sudah mengingatkan padamu bahwa sampanye gratis adalah sumber musibah .
Back-translation	: Phineas, I'm sure I've reminded you that free champagne is a source of disaster .

The utterance of Data 387 portrays translation of idioms of similar meaning and form by translate 'recipe for disaster' to 'source of disaster.' The meaning behind the idiom 'recipe for disaster' is the likelihood to have unpleasant consequences. The Indonesian language has an Idiom with a similar meaning and form, which is 'source of disaster.'

The next strategy used by the Indonesian dubbing is **idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form**. An example is given below:

Data 1.433	
Utterance	: Oh, pull yourself together , Carlyle.
Indonesian Dubbing	: Oh Sadarlah , Carlyle.
Back-translation	: Oh wake up , Carlyle.

The utterance of data 1.433 is an example translation of an idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form. The expression 'pull yourself together' has the meaning to recover control of one's emotion. This phrase is fitting for this context as Philip was upset about Barnum's decision. However, there is no equivalent idiom that has the same form as the SL. As a result, the translator translates it using another expression which is 'Oh wake up.'

Similar to how loan words are frequently used to refer to culturally specific items, **borrowing the source language idiom** is also frequently used to refer to culturally specific items. Here is an example:

Data 1.361	
Utterance	: Now, I know that sounds like Barnum Humbug
Indonesian Dubbing	: Kini, saya tahu terkesan seperti Barnum humbug .
Back-translation	: Now, I know I sound like Barnum humbug .

The utterance of data 1.361 is an instance of borrowing the source language idiom used in translation. The translator decides to borrow the word ‘Humbug’ for translation. By itself, the word humbug means deceptive or false talk or behavior. Supposedly, an equivalent for this expression in Bahasa is called ‘omong kosong.’

The eleventh strategy in the Indonesian dubbing is **paraphrase**. Below is an example:

Data 1.114

Utterance : Surely **not for the faint of heart**, but I can tell you’re gonna love it.

Indonesian Dubbing : Tentunya **tidak terlalu mengesankan**. Tapi aku yakin anda akan suka.

Back-translation : Certainly **not very impressive**. But I’m sure you’ll like it.

The utterance of data 1.114 portrays the use of idiom translation by paraphrase by translating ‘not for the faint of heart’ to ‘not very impressive.’ The meaning of ‘not for the faint of heart’ is to lack the courage to face something difficult or dangerous. Here, the translator uses completely different words and even meanings to translate from SL to TL.

The next strategy present in the Indonesian dubbing is **omission of a play on idiom**. This is the example:

Data 1.437

Utterance : Five minutes **to curtain**.

Indonesian Dubbing : Lima menit **lagi mulai**.

Back-translation : Five minutes **to start**.

The utterance of data 1.437 showcases the use of omission of a play on idiom by translating ‘to curtain’ to ‘to start.’ The phrase ‘to curtain’ is a common theater term that signifies that a show will start. This theater term is uncommon in the Indonesian language. As a result, omission is done.

Another strategy employed by Indonesian dubbing is **omission of entire idiom**. The instance below is an example:

Data 1.71

Utterance : What are you looking at, **flop-doodle?**

Indonesian Dubbing : Hey! **kenapa kau lihat-lihat begitu?**

Back-translation : Hey! **Why are you looking like that?**

The utterance of data 1.71 portrays an example of the omission of an entire idiom. The translator omits the translation of flop-doodle as there is no equivalent of the fixed expression in the Indonesian language.

CONCLUSION

In both the Indonesian subtitle and dubbing, the general word strategy is commonly used in the Indonesian subtitle and dubbing for cases where gender is related. Translation by a more neutral word is used for words that contain double meanings in one language but not in the other. Cultural substitution is commonly used to translate interjections and common expressions. Loan words are used to translate nouns of places and culturally specific items. Paraphrase using related words deal with the changes in word order to enhance the naturalness of translation. Paraphrase using unrelated words is used to translate non-equivalent expressions, and omission is used in translation when there are repetitions or interjections. To conclude, similar translation

strategies are used by both Indonesian subtitles and dubbing to deal with similar translation problems. Slight differences could be found for cases where there are synonyms to translate a word.

REFERENCES

- Baker, M. (2018). *In other words: A coursebook on translation* (3rd ed.). Routledge.
- Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (2007). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods* (5th ed.). Pearson.
- Elnamoury, M. (2014). *In other words: The translational challenges of dubbing and subtitling*. Retrieved from: <https://arablit.org/2014/03/02/in-other-words-the-translational-challenges-of-dubbing-and-subtitling/>
- Hatim, B. & Munday, J. (2004). *Translation: An advanced resource book for students*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429266348>
- IMDb. (n.d.). *The greatest showman awards*. IMDb. Retrieved August 5, 2021, from <https://www.imdb.com/title/tt1485796/awards/>
- Kelly, D. (2014). *A handbook for translator trainers: Translation practice explained*. Routledge.
- Khalaf, B. K. (2016). An introduction to subtitling: Challenges and strategies. *International Journal of English Language, Literature, and Translation studies*, 3(1), 122–129. <http://www.ijelr.in/3.1.16/122-129%20BILAL%20KHALID%20KHALAF.pdf>
- Oxford University Press. (n.d.). Subtitle. In *Lexico*. Retrieved June 14, 2021, from <https://www.lexico.com/definition/subtitle>