

Strategies Used to Translate the Dialogue Texts and Narrations in *Raider of the Copper Hill*

Agnes Bonita Setiawan¹, Julia Eka Rini²

English Department, Faculty of Humanities and Creative Industries, Petra Christian University,
Siwalankerto 121-131, Surabaya, 60236, INDONESIA
Email: a11200017@john.petra.ac.id¹, jerini@petra.ac.id²

ABSTRACT

Translators employ strategies as not every word has its direct equivalence in another language. This study aims to examine the strategies employed in the translation of dialogue texts and narrations found in *Raider of the Copper Hill* into Indonesian. Furthermore, the writer employs a qualitative approach using Baker's (2018) strategies to examine each dialogue text and narration in the comic and see whether the strategies succeed in maintaining the meaning. Baker's (2018) strategies the translator uses to translate the dialogue texts, namely: translation by a more general word, by a less expressive word, by cultural substitution, using a related word, by paraphrase using unrelated words, and by omission. To translate the narrations, the translator employs the same strategies except the less expressive word strategy. However, some tones and humor contained in the texts get altered.

Keywords: comic, dialogue text, narration, *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck*, translation strategies

INTRODUCTION

Translation is what makes literature, including comics, possible to be read anywhere around the globe (Simurka, 2020). However, not every word or expression in the source language (SL) has its direct equivalence in the target language (TL). Therefore, translators often employ strategies during the translation process to maintain the whole meaning as close as possible to the original text. In addition, translating comics has its own challenges since the layout of comics, which includes panels and speech balloons, is limited (Zanettin, 2014). Translators must work within these layouts to ensure that the translated text fits appropriately while maintaining the readability.

The purpose of this study is to examine the strategies employed in the translation of two linguistic aspects of a comic, which are dialogue texts and narrations, from English as the TL into Indonesian as the SL. Dialogue texts are placed inside speech or thought bubbles (Kaindl, 1999), which are important to keep the plot going and reflect the comic characters' personalities and backgrounds. Meanwhile, narrations are the texts in rectangular boxes that are put at the corner top or bottom of a panel that help establish the setting of a scene, such as place and time (Whardy, 2022), and explain moods and situations in the panel (Kaindl, 1999).

As the subject, the writer used a comic titled *Raider of the Copper Hill*, which comes from a Disney comic series called *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck*. It explores the story of teenage Scrooge McDuck who joins the copper rush in Montana where he discovers a small copper vein similar to the one at the Anaconda Mine, a massive copper mine that earns a lot of fortune. Based on the Apex Law, Scrooge owns the whole Anaconda Mine. Unfortunately, he has to sell the mine immediately as his family faces a terrible financial crisis.

For the analysis, the writer used eight translation strategies proposed by Baker (2018), which consist of: translation by a more general word, translation by a more neutral/less expressive word, translation by cultural substitution, translation using a loan word/loan word

**Setiawan; Rini: Strategies Used to Translate the Dialogue Texts and Narrations
in *Raider of the Copper Hill***

plus explanation, translation by paraphrase using a related word, translation by paraphrase using unrelated words, translation by omission, and translation by illustration.

METHOD

The writer conducted her study using a qualitative approach. In addition, both the data and source of data were the dialogue texts in the speech bubbles and the narrations in both the English and Indonesian versions of *Raider of the Copper Hill*. The writer read both the English and Indonesian versions of the comic, then typed out each dialogue text and narration and listed them using a two-digit numbering system. The first digit is to distinguish whether it is a dialogue text or narration. The second digit represents the order of the dialogue text or the narration. For example, “no. 1.3” indicated the third dialogue text occurred in the comic, and “no. 2.7” indicated the seventh narration occurred in the comic. Finally, the writer analyzed the strategies used in translating the dialogue texts and the narrations using Baker’s (2018) translation strategies.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The writer discovered that the translator uses six Baker’s (2018) strategies to translate the dialogue texts, namely: translation by a more general word, by a less expressive word, by cultural substitution, using a related word, by paraphrase using unrelated words, and by omission. To translate the narrations, the translator uses the same strategies except the less expressive word strategy. Moreover, the translator also uses other strategies and does not translate some items/expressions although they have impact in the dialogue text or narration.

Translation of Dialogue Text and Narration Using Translation by a More General Word Strategy

Baker (2018) says that translating with a more general word works effectively as the translator can use a more general word in the TL that matches the propositional meaning of the original word.

Table 1. Example of Dialogue Text Using Translation by a More General Word Strategy

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language	Dialogue Text in Target Language
1.27	Yeah, but <u>my backers</u> expected silver! Besides, it's down too deep to be worth digging out!	<u>Rekan-rekanku</u> mengharapkan perak! Lagipula tembaga itu terpendam sangat dalam, butuh biaya besar menggalinya!

Backer is "someone who gives financial support to something" (Cambridge Dictionary, n.d.). The types of financial support are grants which do not need to be repaid and loans which have to be repaid (Faster Capital, 2023). For context, the speaker has to pay back the loans, which is implied where he feels disadvantaged as he buys a mine that does not contain silver. However, the translator translates *backers* to more general words, which are *rekan-rekanku*. According to Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa (n.d., Definition 1), *rekan* is “*teman (sekerja)*” (coworkers). The translation takes away the emphasis of loans since someday Marcus Daly has to repay his backers, which means that he is not in an equal position with his backers.

Table 2. Example of Narration Using Translation by a More General Word Strategy

No.	Narration in Source Language	Narration in Target Language
2.1	While still <u>a mere teenager</u> , Scrooge "Buck" McDuck became one of the best cowpunchers working for Murdo MacKenzie, The Cattle King of the Montana territory.	Ketika masih <u>sangat muda</u> , Gobek Bebek telah menjadi penggembala ternak yang bekerja pada Murdo MacKenzie, raja ternak di wilayah Montana.

The translator paraphrases *a mere teenager* to *sangat muda* (very young) in the translation which does not define any specific age as *very young* is very subjective. The English narration would suggest Scrooge is so young he lacks experience. Hence, the translator fails to inform the readers about Scrooge's lack of experience due to his young age.

Translation of Dialogue Text Using Translation by a More Neutral/Less Expressive Word Strategy

According to Baker (2018), this strategy is employed to translate uncommon words that do not have a direct equivalent in TL into less expressive and evocative words.

Table 3. Example of Dialogue Text Using Translation by a More Neutral/Less Expressive Word Strategy

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language	Dialogue Text in Target Language
1.11	What do you aim to do, Buck? Find a little homestead somewhere?	Kamu mau menetap, Buck?
1.12	<u>You bet!</u> And this looks like a great area!	<u>Tentu!</u> Tempat ini kelihatannya bagus!

For context, Scrooge's colleague asks him if he will stay in Butte, to which Scrooge replies with the dialogue text no. 1.12. *You bet* is an "expression used in English to emphasize a statement" (Cambridge Dictionary, n.d.). The phrase does not have a direct equivalence in Indonesian, so the translator translates it into *tentu*. According to Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa (n.d., Definition 1), *tentu* is defined as "*pasti; tidak berubah lagi*" (certain; unchangeable). However, the expression *you bet* shows more enthusiasm than *tentu*; hence causing Scrooge to sound less enthusiastic with his decision.

Translation of Dialogue Text and Narration Using Translation by Cultural Substitution Strategy

Baker (2018) states that this strategy involves replacing a particular cultural item in SL with a substitute in TL that might not express the same meaning precisely but is expected to arouse a similar response in the TL readers.

Table 4. Example of Dialogue Text Using Translation by Cultural Substitution Strategy

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language	Dialogue Text in Target Language
-----	----------------------------------	----------------------------------

**Setiawan; Rini: Strategies Used to Translate the Dialogue Texts and Narrations
in *Raider of the Copper Hill***

1.84	I don't see how! Judgin' by them ore streaks, you're digging in the wrong direction! And you swing that pick like a schoolmarm!	Tapi aku heran kalau melihat lintasan galianmu! Itu salah arah dan cara mengayun beliung pun seperti seorang nenek tua!
------	---	---

Howard, the speaker of the dialogue, is telling Scrooge that he will never be able to make any copper by swinging his pick like a schoolmarm. *Schoolmarm* is "a woman who is a schoolteacher especially in a rural or small-town school" (Merriam-Webster Dictionary, n.d., Definition 1). It does not have a direct Indonesian equivalence and is unfamiliar in Indonesian context. Therefore, the translator changes it to *nenek tua* (old lady) because Indonesian readers are more familiar with an old lady being weaker than a female teacher.

Table 5. Example of Narration Using Translation by Cultural Substitution Strategy

No.	Narration in Source Language	Narration in Target Language
2.15	At that moment, <u>several dozen</u> of Butte's meanest miners, cowpokes, tanners, waddies, and various and sundry ne'er-do-wells are learning they're no match for the last of clan McDuck.	Saat yang sama, <u>berpuluh-puluh</u> pekerja tambang Butte, peternak, penggiring sapi, pengangguran, dan lain-lainnya menjadi saksi bahwa mereka bukanlah tandingan bebek keturunan terakhir klan Bebek.

The term *several dozen* has a direct equivalence in Indonesian *beberapa lusin*. However, according to Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa (n.d.), the definition of *lusin* is "satuan jumlah sama dengan 12 buah" (unit quantity equals 12 pieces), implying that it is used for a unit of goods, not for a unit for a number of people. Therefore, the translator changes it into *berpuluh-puluh* which can be used for a number of people.

Translation of Dialogue Text and Narration Using Translation by Paraphrase Using a Related Word Strategy

According to Baker (2018), if the TL lacks the lexicalization of the concept, paraphrases using a related word can be used to translate the item. This involves modifying the item or providing a detailed explanation of the term's meaning (Baker, 2018).

Table 6. Example of Dialogue Text Using Translation by Paraphrase Using a Related Word Strategy

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language	Dialogue Text in Target Language
1.75	Father! Stop talking to that grubby workman! You'll get cooties!	Ayah, jangan bicara dengan pekerja kotor itu! Nanti kecipratan kutu!
1.78	B-L-B-B-B!	Weeek!
1.80	My son John <u>has a problem that a stout horsewhip would fix...</u> But, well...	Anakku Joni <u>nakal sekali!</u> Mustinya ia harus dihajar dengan cemeti kuda!

Howard says that his son John has to be lashed with a horsewhip so that he gains a lesson in manners not to mock older people. The literal translation for the dialogue text should be *punya masalah yang bisa diatasi dengan cemeti kuda*, but it is unclear how John's

mannerisms relate to the horsewhip. Therefore, the translator paraphrases it to a less ambiguous dialogue (my son John is very naughty! He should be punished with a horsewhip!).

Table 7. Example of Narration Using Translation by Paraphrase Using a Related Word Strategy

No.	Narration in Source Language	Narration in Target Language
2.10	<u>No stranger to hard work</u> , the lad kept moving on! He knew that under that scrubby land lay one-third of the world's copper, and he hoped that one day his labors would pay off.	<u>Karena telah terbiasa bekerja keras</u> , anak muda itu terus berjalan! Dia tahu di bawah tanah di sana terdapat sepertiga kandungan tembaga di dunia, dan dia berharap suatu hari usahanya akan berhasil...

The phrase *no stranger to hard work* relates to Scrooge McDuck himself, who has worked hard his entire life to maintain his family. The direct translation of the English narration should be *karena sudah tidak asing dengan kerja keras*, which may be too wordy and may not fit the narration box. Therefore, the translator simplifies the phrase in the translation to *karena telah terbiasa bekerja keras* (being used to working hard).

Translation of Dialogue Text and Narration Using Translation by Paraphrase Using Unrelated Words Strategy

Translation by paraphrase using unrelated words functions by altering a superordinate or unpacking the meaning without using a related word (Baker, 2018).

Table 8. Example of Dialogue Text Using Translation by Paraphrase Using Unrelated Words Strategy

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language	Dialogue Text in Target Language
1.20	Copper?! Har-de-har! You'll have a mine full a' <u>little baby pennies!</u>	Tembaga? Ha ha ha! Kamu punya tambang penuh <u>biji tembaga!</u>

American pennies are the one cent coins that are red in color and consist of zinc coated with copper (U.S. Mint, n.d.), which are also not very valuable. The man is mocking Scrooge for only having a copper mine that would only be used to produce one cent coins. Meanwhile, Indonesian coins are mostly silver and do not look like they contain any copper, so the translator changes it to *biji tembaga* (copper ore) to fit the Indonesian context. However, the translation fails to inform the Indonesian readers that copper is thought to be worthless at that time.

Table 9. Example of Narration Using Translation by Paraphrase Using Unrelated Words Strategy

No.	Narration in Source Language	Narration in Target Language
2.15	At that moment, several dozen of Butte's meanest miners, cowpokes, tanners, waddies, and various and sundry <u>ne'er-do-wells</u> are learning they're no match for the last of clan McDuck.	Saat yang sama, berpuluh-puluh pekerja tambang Butte, peternak, penggiring sapi, <u>pengangguran</u> , dan lain-lainnya menjadi saksi bahwa mereka bukanlah tandingan bebek keturunan terakhir klan Bebek.

**Setiawan; Rini: Strategies Used to Translate the Dialogue Texts and Narrations
in *Raider of the Copper Hill***

The narration makes fun of the people of Butte by calling them *ne'er-do-wells* (never-do-wells) which implies they never work really hard their entire lives. The translator translates it to *pengangguran* (unemployed). According to Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa (n.d., Definition 1), *menganggur* is defined as “*tidak melakukan apa-apa; tidak bekerja*” (not doing anything; not working). *Pengangguran* here still has the same idea as *ne'er-do-wells* as it refers to the people of Butte who never work hard. However, the translation becomes more direct and loses the sarcastic tone in the narration.

Translation of Dialogue Text and Narration Using Translation by Omission Strategy

Baker (2018) states that translators may decide not to translate a certain item in SL if it is not important for the development of the text. This strategy can also be used if translating the item would take readers' attention away with lengthy explanations (Baker, 2018).

Table 10. Example of Dialogue Text Using Translation by Omission Strategy

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language	Dialogue Text in Target Language
1.8	*sigh!* Suits me! I'm startin' to leak when I drink <u>water</u> !	Tak apa! Badanku mulai bocor kalau aku minum!

Scrooge's body is entangled with tight fence wire which causes holes in his skin. He jokes that the water he drinks leaks from the holes. According to Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa (n.d.), *minum* is defined as “*memasukkan air (atau benda cair) ke dalam mulut dan meneguknya*” (putting water (or a liquid object) into the mouth and gulping it down). The idea of *minum* is not always consuming water as it can be any liquid. The translator here omits *water* as any other liquid would still leak from the holes on Scrooge's body.

Table 11. Example of Narration Using Translation by Omission Strategy

No.	Narration in Source Language	Narration in Target Language
2.6	Since a miner owned any land he worked on for as long as he lived on the site, Scrooge built a <u>portable</u> homesteader's shack which could be moved from spot to spot.	Karena seorang penambang boleh memiliki tanah yang sedang digalinya selama dia tinggal di situ, Gober membuat gubuk kecil yang bisa dipindah...

The definition of *portable* is "light and small enough to be easily carried or moved" (Cambridge Dictionary, n.d., Definition 1). Although the translator omits *portable*, the idea of *portable* in the narration is still clear as the translator has inserted *yang bisa dipindah* (which could be moved) in the translation. Therefore, the omission does not affect the narration at all.

Translation of Dialogue Text Using Other Strategy

Besides translation strategies proposed by Baker (2018), the writer found out that the translator of the comic also uses other translation strategies where he/she changes the whole meanings of the dialogue texts.

Table 12. Example of Dialogue Text Using Other Strategy

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language (English)	Dialogue Text in Target Language (Indonesian)
1.129	I quit! Effective immediately!	Istirahat sebentar. ah!

Hortense the horse is running as fast as she could to take Scrooge to his claim the earliest. Later, Hortense is exhausted and says, “*I quit! Effective immediately!*” which is translated to *istirahat sebentar, ah!* (take a short break). The translator changes the whole meaning of the dialogue instead of paraphrasing it. Moreover, the English dialogue is humorous because as a horse, she cannot quit herself from her owner; it is against her owner's will. The translation, therefore, reduces the humor.

Translation of Dialogue Text and Narration Using No Translation

The writer discovered that the translator removes an item/expression in the translation although the item/expression has an impact in the dialogue text and narration.

Table 13. Example of Untranslated Dialogue Text

No.	Dialogue Text in Source Language	Dialogue Text in Target Language
1.116	What? Having the <u>monograms on my silk shirts</u> embroidered to read "Richest Duck in Montana"?	Apa? Membuat sulaman 'Bebek Terkaya di Montana' pada bajuku?

By officially owning the massive mine, Scrooge can become the richest duck in Montana and plans to show it by wearing a silk shirt embroidered with his monogram. In the Indonesian dialogue, the translator removes *monograms on my silk shirts*. *Monogram* is "a symbol, usually formed from the first letters of a person's names joined together, that is sewn or printed on clothes or other possessions" (Cambridge Dictionary, n.d., Definition 1), which symbolizes luxury (Goldring, n.d.). Moreover, *silk* also symbolizes wealth and status (Naglak, 2013). The deletion of the phrase reduces the essence of wealth and status symbolized by monograms and silk.

Table 14. Example of Untranslated Narration

No.	Narration in Source Language (English)	Narration in Target Language (Indonesian)
2.12	Two cents and two hours later...	2 jam kemudian...

Since Scrooge underestimates Howard for his prospecting skills, Howard bets two cents to show Scrooge how to do it right. The deletion of *two cents* loses the humor in the panel where Howard has successfully shown Scrooge how to prospect correctly, and Scrooge loses two cents in the bet.

The comic's translator does not employ translation using a loan word and by illustration. The reason the translator does not use a loan word is because the Indonesian readers might not have sufficient proficiency in English to understand loan words and the translator prefers localization over foreignization, so it fits better with the Indonesian readers' cultural context. Moreover, the translator does not use translation by illustration most likely because the illustration could take a lot of space inside the panels, and he/she does not want to alter the artwork in any way, including adding illustrations.

Setiawan; Rini: Strategies Used to Translate the Dialogue Texts and Narrations
in *Raider of the Copper Hill*

The writer suggests translation by paraphrase using unrelated words is the most effective strategy to translate both the dialogue texts and narrations. The reason for this is that the translator can change or add any words while maintaining the original meanings, tones, and humor in the translation.

CONCLUSION

The six Baker 's (2018) strategies used in the comic have kept most of the meanings in the dialogue texts and narrations. However, while the meanings still stay in the Indonesian texts, some tones and humor in the Indonesian dialogue and narrations get slightly changed and reduced from the original texts. Therefore, the translator has to consider which strategy is appropriate not only to connect to the previous and next panels but also to maintain the original meanings, tones, and humor in the translation.

REFERENCES

- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa. (n.d.). Lusin. In *KBBI VI daring*. Retrieved March 19, 2024, <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/lusin>
- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa. (n.d.). Menganggur. In *KBBI VI daring*. Retrieved March 24, 2024, <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/menganggur>
- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa. (n.d.). Minum. In *KBBI VI daring*. Retrieved May 4, 2024, <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/minum>
- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa. (n.d.). Rekan. In *KBBI VI daring*. Retrieved March 11, 2024, from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/rekan>
- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa. (n.d.). Tentu. In *KBBI VI daring*. Retrieved March 12, 2024, from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/tentu>
- Baker, M. (2018). *In other words: A coursebook on translation* (3rd ed.). Routledge.
- Cambridge Dictionary. (n.d.). Backer. In *Cambridge dictionary*. Retrieved February 16, 2024, from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/backer>
- Cambridge Dictionary. (n.d.). Monogram. In *Cambridge dictionary*. Retrieved March 6, 2024, from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/monogram>
- Cambridge Dictionary. (n.d.). Portable. In *Cambridge dictionary*. Retrieved March 12, 2024, from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/portable>
- Cambridge Dictionary. (n.d.). You bet. In *Cambridge dictionary*. Retrieved February 15, 2024, from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/you-bet>
- FasterCapital. (2024, February 1). *Types of financial assistance for startup businesses*. <https://fastercapital.com/content/Types-of-Financial-Assistance-for-Startup-Businesses.html>
- Goldring, K. (n.d.). *Monogram logos: How to deliver the ultimate punchline*. Tailor Brands. <https://www.tailorbrands.com/blog/monogram-logos>
- Kaindl, K. (1999). Thump, whizz, poom: A framework for the study of comics under translation. *Target. International Journal of Translation Studies*, 11(2), 263–288. <https://doi.org/10.1075/target.11.2.05kai>
- Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Schoolmarm. In *Merriam-Webster.com dictionary*. Retrieved February 27, 2024, from <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/schoolmarm>
- Naglak, G. (2013, June 18). *Dress for success*. Science History Institute. <https://www.sciencehistory.org/stories/magazine/dress-for-success/>
- Rosa, D. (2009). *Kisah hidup Paman Gober* (Vol. 2) (Penerbitan Sarana Bobo, Trans.). Penerbitan Sarana Bobo. (Original work published 1996).
- Rosa, D. (1996). *Raider of the copper hill*. Gemstone Publishing.

- Simurka, M. (2020, November 11). *The importance of translation*. Lexika.
<https://www.lexika-translations.com/blog/the-importance-of-translation/>
- Whardy, J. (2022, November 1). *The importance of a narrator in comics*.
<https://www.janetwhardy.com/the-importance-of-a-narrator-in-comics/>
- United States Mint Coin Classroom. (n.d.). *Fun facts related to the penny*. United States Mint.
<https://www.usmint.gov/learn/kids/coins/fun-facts/category/penny>
- Zanettin, F. (Ed.). (2014). *Comic in translation*. Routledge.